



**THE STATES assembled on Wednesday
8th December 2010, at 09.30 a.m. under
the Presidency of the Deputy Bailiff,
William James Bailhache, Esquire.**

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Deputy Collin Hedley Egré of St. Peter – ill
Deputy Sean Seamus Patrick Augustine Power of St. Brelade – ill
Deputy Montfort Tadier of St. Brelade – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.36 a.m.)

Prayers

Documents presented or laid

States of Jersey Complaints Board: findings – complaint against a decision of the Minister for Planning and Environment regarding No. 49 St. Mark’s Road/Byron Lane, St. Helier. R.144/2010.
Presented: 8th December 2010.
Privileges and Procedures Committee.

Notification of lodged propositions

Expenditure Proposals for 2012 and 2013 and Draft Budget Statement 2011 (P.157/2010): seventh amendment (P.157/2010 Amd.(7)) – amendment. P.157/2010.
Lodged: 8th December 2010. Amd.(7)Amd.
Minister for Treasury and Resources.

Withdrawal of lodged propositions

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with Standing Order 34(1), the proposer of the following proposition lodged “au Greffe” had informed the Greffier of the States that it had been withdrawn –

Expenditure Proposals for 2012 and 2013 and Draft Budget Statement 2011 (P.157/2010): sixth amendment (paragraph (b)). P.157/2010.
Lodged: 22nd November 2010. Amd.(6)
Senator F. du H. Le Gresley. (paragraph (b))

Expenditure Proposals for 2012 and 2013 and Draft Budget Statement 2011 P.157/2010

THE STATES resumed consideration of an amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier to paragraph (b) of the Expenditure Proposals for 2012 and 2013 and Draft Budget Statement 2011 (P.157/2010), that after the words “as set out in the Budget Statement” there should be inserted the words “except that, in Summary Table B ‘States Income 2011’ on page 74 the estimate of total income for 2011 shall be decreased by £15 million by maintaining the rate of Goods and Services Tax at 3% until May 31st 2011”; and continued consideration of an amendment of the Connétable of St. Helier that in paragraph (1) of that amendment, for the words “May 31st 2012” there should be substituted the words “December 31st 2011”.

THE STATES rejected a proposition of Senator James Leslie Perchard, in accordance with the provisions of Standing Order 84, that the debate on the matter be put to the vote.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 22

Senator T.A. Le Sueur
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Senator T.J. Le Main
 Senator B.E. Shenton
 Senator J.L. Perchard
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)

CONTRE: 26

Senator P.F. Routier
 Senator F.E. Cohen
 Senator A. Breckon
 Senator S.C. Ferguson
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

ABSTAIN: 1

Connétable of St. Mary

THE STATES resumed consideration of an amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier to paragraph (b) of the Expenditure Proposals for 2012 and 2013 and Draft Budget Statement 2011 (P.157/2010), and adopting an amendment of the Connétable of St. Helier, agreed that in paragraph (1) of the amendment, for the words “May 31st 2012” there should be substituted the words “December 31st 2011”.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 29

Senator A. Breckon
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of St. Mary
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

CONTRE: 22

Senator T.A. Le Sueur
 Senator P.F. Routier
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Senator T.J. Le Main
 Senator B.E. Shenton
 Senator F.E. Cohen
 Senator J.L. Perchard
 Senator S.C. Ferguson
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)

ABSTAIN: 0

THE STATES rejected an amendment of Senator Sarah Craig Ferguson that in paragraph (1) of the amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier to paragraph (b) of the Expenditure Proposals for 2012 and 2013 and Draft Budget Statement 2011 (P.157/2010), after the words “until May 31st 2012” there should be inserted the words “and the estimate of the revenue raised shall be amended by cancelling any planned increases in Income Tax exemptions”.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 8

Senator J.L. Perchard
 Senator S.C. Ferguson
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

CONTRE: 38

Senator T.A. Le Sueur
 Senator P.F. Routier
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Senator T.J. Le Main
 Senator B.E. Shenton
 Senator F.E. Cohen
 Senator A. Breckon
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley

ABSTAIN: 0

Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of St. Mary
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)

THE STATES rejected an amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier, as amended by the Connétable of St. Helier, that in paragraph (b) of the Expenditure Proposals for 2012 and 2013 and Draft Budget Statement 2011 (P.157/2010), after the words “as set out in the Budget Statement” there should be inserted the words –

“except that, in Summary Table B ‘States Income 2011’ on page 74 the estimate of total income for 2011 shall be decreased by £15 million by maintaining the rate of Goods and Services Tax at 3% until December 31st 2011;”.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 22

Senator A. Breckon
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)

CONTRE: 29

Senator T.A. Le Sueur
 Senator P.F. Routier
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Senator T.J. Le Main
 Senator B.E. Shenton
 Senator F.E. Cohen
 Senator J.L. Perchard
 Senator S.C. Ferguson
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand

ABSTAIN: 0

Deputy of Grouville	Connétable of St. Ouen
Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)	Connétable of Trinity
Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)	Connétable of Grouville
Deputy S. Pitman (H)	Connétable of St. Brelade
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)	Connétable of St. Martin
Deputy M. Tadier (B)	Connétable of St. Saviour
Deputy of St. Mary	Connétable of St. Clement
Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)	Connétable of St. Peter
Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)	Connétable of St. Mary
Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)	Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)	Deputy of St. Ouen
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)	Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
	Deputy of Trinity
	Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
	Deputy of St. John
	Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)
	Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)
	Deputy E.J. Noel (L)
	Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)

Deputy Bailiff's ruling under Standing Order 167(4)

The Deputy Bailiff made a ruling in relation to the circulation of papers within the Chamber by Members who had already spoken within a debate. The Deputy Bailiff, in accordance with Standing Order 167(4), ruled that the circulation of such papers constituted a second speech and was therefore contrary to Standing Order 103(1). However, he determined that if any Member who had yet to speak within a debate wished to have a document circulated as part of their speech, then that would be acceptable.

Arrangement of future business

THE STATES agreed to meet, if necessary, on Friday 10th December 2010 in order to complete public business.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 43

Senator T.A. Le Sueur
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Senator T.J. Le Main
 Senator F.E. Cohen
 Senator J.L. Perchard
 Senator A. Breckon
 Senator S.C. Ferguson
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of Trinity

CONTRE: 6

Senator P.F. Routier
 Senator B.E. Shenton
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy of St. Mary

ABSTAIN: 0

Connétable of Grouville
Connétable of St. Brelade
Connétable of St. Martin
Connétable of St. John
Connétable of St. Saviour
Connétable of St. Lawrence
Connétable of St. Mary
Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
Deputy of St. Martin
Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S)
Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
Deputy of St. Ouen
Deputy of Grouville
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)
Deputy of Trinity
Deputy S. Pitman (H)
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
Deputy of St. John
Deputy M. Tadier (B)
Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)
Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)
Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)
Deputy E.J. Noel (L)
Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)
Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)
Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

Adjournment

THE STATES adjourned, having agreed to reconvene on Thursday 9th December 2010, to continue consideration of the Expenditure Proposals for 2012 and 2013 and Draft Budget Statement 2011 (P.157/2010) and the outstanding items of public business.

THE STATES rose at 5.40 p.m.

M.N. DE LA HAYE

Greffier of the States